2015

On The Hallelujah Efect: Priming Consumers, Recording Music, and the Spirit of Tragedy

Babette Babich
Fordham University, babich@fordham.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://fordham.bepress.com/phil_babich

Part of the Audio Arts and Acoustics Commons, Continental Philosophy Commons, Digital Humanities Commons, Esthetics Commons, Musicology Commons, Radio Commons, and the Theory and Criticism Commons

Recommended Citation
http://fordham.bepress.com/phil_babich/63

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Philosophy at DigitalResearch@Fordham. It has been accepted for inclusion in Articles and Chapters in Academic Book Collections by an authorized administrator of DigitalResearch@Fordham. For more information, please contact jwatson9@fordham.edu.
ON THE HALLELUJAH EFFECT: PRIMING CONSUMERS, RECORDING MUSIC, AND THE SPIRIT OF TRAGEDY

by Babette Babich

What is the technology of sound? What is the technology of the technical reproducibility of sound? Writing after Martin Heidegger's questioning of The Origin of the Work of Art, and at the conclusion of a list of a variety of technological means of reproducibility in the various spheres of art, Walter Benjamin reports smoothly (which is just how we scholars like it) that "the technical production of sound was tackled at the end of the last century." Theodor Adorno adds complexity (which is not how we like it), raising the phenomenological question of the techno-mechanical transmission of music in his The Current of Music. With yet more complexity, going back to the 1870's — indeed to 770 BC with the earliest system for the technical reproduction of sound (i.e., the Greek invention of "truly phonetic writing" as Ivan Illich argues) — there is the spirit of music at the heart of Nietzsche's The Birth of Tragedy. It is in order to raise the question of the technical reproducibility of sound, that my study of The Hallelujah Effect begins in the present day (with YouTube and other media), only to turn to radio and the current of music in the era of the second World War, in order, ultimately, to explore the implications of reading, as Nietzsche does (and Illich only accords with Nietzsche's reading of), ancient Greek as a technology for reproducing sound: the spirit of music.

1. SONIC BRANDING, MEDIA, AND ONLINE PORN

The 'effect' of Leonard Cohen's Hallelujah corresponds to its plays and its covers on radio or television as this is simultaneously echoed on YouTube, which last is itself a media version of the eternal return of the same in potentia (i.e., depending, and this is meant as a joke, on the number +1 of relevant hits), an echoing effect related to the resonant frequency that is a pop music 'hit' or a viral video and so on. Some commentators echoing the scholarly analysis of mimesis speak of "memes" but the term (like the remix recoil of what the electronic remix artist Steve Goodman calls "memetic" music) emphasizes not only repetition but also evanescence, poised to suppose such things no more than passing fads, like a mental hula hoop, here today, gone tomorrow. Beyoncé, Miley Cyrus, Game of Thrones, any latest thing.

The Hallelujah effect is about the working of 'entrainment,' 'effected' as it is and most efficiently so by sound. The brain, rather more literally than one might imagine, aligns its own wavepatterns with certain wavelengths, heard and unheard (the sonic including both subsonic, as Goodman points out, and the supersonic), which last "unheard" can also be the same as saying what is in effect "heard" as Sharon Weinberger writes "only by you." The phenomenon is relevant to studies of heart beats and other syncytial coordinations in the body but it also has military applications and these in turn bleed over into popular culture, as Goodman has explored this from a number of perspectives studying both the military uses of sound as well as the military influences on club and pop music. Beyond club music culture and apart from the military, everyday television shows employ
distinctive opening sound sequences and certain commercial jingles are associated with certain brands.

This is your brain on drugs.

Like drugs, the joke in question can be varied: this is your brain on line: on YouTube, on Facebook, on Twitter.

The very point of media is mediation, that is connection as the journalist Vance Packard and the communications scholar Marshall McLuhan both observed themselves drawing upon a phenomenon already adumbrated (and to be sure inaugurated) by Edward Bernays. The sexual and the social drive ‘effect’ priming, programming, branding. Advertisement works and, to argue contra a popular internet meme, the internet is not so much full of cats as it is full of, suffused with, percolated through and by ads, ads interrupted by further ads, ads everywhere, all the way down, and all the way up. Where ads once crawled across the page (drawing the user to track them and thus fixate upon them to click them away), today studies of eye movements are used to determine placement such that we are often unaware of the bill-boardification, as it were, of the webpage as indeed our email inboxes, spam filter and all.

The stimulus effect interests me in The Hallelujah Effect and it the stimulus effect that interests marketing researchers just as it also interests the military.

One waits for the stimulus and today, with or without AOL, one’s phone signals a tweet “connection,” a Facebook comment, an appointment, a text. One looks for — one checks, as one says — one’s messages, one’s email, Facebook account, blog posts, etc. Anticipation and satisfaction are the same.

Indeed, one of the reasons for the great success of Twitter is that we at no point want to find ourselves without a text to read. We do not want to miss a connection, a mention, a message and to that end, although studies of Twitter do not usually highlight this: we arrange to “feed” ourselves tweets as texts, just as we might subscribe to blog posts so as to clutter our own inboxes on our own initiative — really, it can seem when surfing the net, like the metonymic analogue of channel surfing that anything will do.

The extension of communication in time is part of the problem of our dependency on checking in. If the stakes are erotic, the effect is addictive. Students and lovers (and politicians) have to check their cell phones, someone ‘good’ might have signaled a possible connection, something (unclear what) might be in the offing, but to keep the game alive it will not do to answer too slowly (and, so the adumbration of time also holds, as these are all potentially endangered or vulnerable liaisons of possibility/impossibility), too quickly. The result is a constant on-edge, enduring sense of breathless connectivity explored in Her but also more heavy handedly in the surprisingly uncreative 2011 documentary film, Connected.

The problem with porn — where pornography is the graphic depiction of erotic themes (we all know this and this has been known since antiquity) and porn is the online version of the same — is the absence of the erotic. There is an obvious parallel to Heidegger’s observation that the essence of technology is ‘nothing technological.’ And in its current instauration, (online) porn is addictive and the problem with addiction, once we get past the moralizing, is that it is flat, a flattening leading to more of the same: attenuating and numbing. There are images on images, web-sites on web-sites, and the enticement is to find and click on them all. To this degree, porn thus has nothing to do with desire as Lacan recognized and which Lacanian insight Žižek happily channels along with Lacan’s vulgarity, while adding his own.

As addictive as it is, the porn effect, like the Hallelujah effect also changes minds and sensibilities, just as advertising or “branding” does. As studies of its cognitive effects suggest, especially as experienced online, porn tends (not accidentally) to draw the user away from the user’s ‘own’ desires (however constructed these may be in the garden-variety concatenation of power plays and subject structures) to desires not the user’s own. Thus some social scientists and psychiatrists have made this point by analyzing the porn industries’ deployment (and often innovation) of internet engineering tactics, tactics that have everything to do with the nature of the “search” as such (and its reward structure in the brain) and hence everything to do with the nuts and bolts of internet search engines.

Beyond this one can also refer to the studies beloved of cognitive science enthusiasts — and this standard (and may exec up to)
(and standardizing) deployment of behaviorism may be tracked all the way down to the advertising executives on Madison Avenue and all the way up to the campaign managers at the White House. Still more importantly from a phenomenological-existential point of view, one can see the results of this standardizing priming in one’s own (and in others’) actions and responses.

Thus we have all the illustration we need in anyone (whether that anyone be observed in one’s own person or that of another) with access to a cellphone or an iPad or other tablet or laptop. One part of the reason we take note of such attention paid to texting behavior is that the phenomenon of texting — sending and receiving — inspires anxiety by its nature: unlike a phone message which requires that the recipient not only actively check his or her inbox but just as actively or deliberately opt to listen (or not) to any message sent, the next text message comes across already in its entirety (whole that is to say but only if successfully “sent”—and there is an entirely separate phenomenology that attends upon the anxiety of composing a message or series of messages only to see a spate of “message not sent” messages on one’s mobile phone, frozen texts, like preserved dead letters), already there to be read. Corresponding to this phenomenon of known reception, as it were, there are rules for texting and responding, like the often unobserved rules for email reception (and often delayed response), adds to this pressure. For young people in love, communicating by cellphone (though this includes the old as well and age differences are often exaggerated by media), the rhetoric of desire is adumbrated via time delays and over- (and under-) responsiveness to texts sent.

Media involves the whole array of the effects on the soul in the era of the second industrial revolution” as Anders identifies this in his 1956 book, well in advance of McLuhan or anyone else analyzing the consumer’s self-dedication to his or her own production as an unpaid homeworker: creating him or herself as the mass human being. Today Facebook and Twitter and so on do what radio and television and illustrated magazines used to do to manufacture a certain mass or common point of view.

To use the language of cognitive psychology, we are “primed,” and, again, the point of priming, that is in order for priming to be priming, works in precisely in that we not notice it, and indeed dismiss it as irrelevant if we do — for nothing touches our assurance of our own free will and consequently our conviction of our own utterly autonomous self-determination than the notion that we are somehow programmed.

In behavioral (or cognitive) studies in psychology, “priming” also features in marketing or advertising research and scholarship, corresponding to what Adorno characterizes as the “ubiquity” standard or impetus for conditioning of all kinds, especially qua “covert” priming, all of which can be monetized. To this day we speak of “prime” time and talk about radio and television “programming” without reflecting on either the origins or the literality of such terms.

Although some might date it back to Plato’s Republic or, with Neil Postman, the Phaedrus, specific strategies for the manipulation of a target audience may be dated to the early decades of the 20th century. Part of the mechanism has to do with the difference between conscious and unconscious motivation where controlling or influencing popular opinion is a concern for both government and the advertising industry. Thus Edward Bernays, author of Crystallizing Public Opinion drew upon the Freudian theory of the unconscious (Bernays was Freud’s nephew). In marketing, motivational researchers have developed Bernays’ “crystallization” in advertising practice. As one “primes” the pump, one primes the consumer.

II. THE SOUND OF MUSIC AND RADIO

With regard to the seduction of digital media perse, I review not only Adorno’s Current of Music along with Anders’ phenomenology of listening but the “recording consciousness” offered by H. Stith Bennett in his sociological phenomenology of musical practice, On Becoming a Rock Musician.

The approach of The Hallelujah Effect is phenomenological, studying the working of Cohen’s Hallelujah via a return to the things themselves, the medium of the song as heard, exploring the experience of transmitted music as this was once experienced but by unique witnesses those like Adorno (and like Günther Anders and to be sure also like Heidegger and Arnnheim) who were able to have the experience of both radio and recorded music, as it were, for the ‘first time,’ experiencing of music before and after Benjamin’s line of demarcation.
with the “Age of Mechanical Reproduction.” The set includes Nietzsche, but only at its cusp.

This demarcational division is one of the reasons it is complicated to raise the question Nietzsche raised about an even more difficult to imagine situation, namely that of ancient Greece and the birth (out of the ‘spirit’ of music), of the tragic art form. For as may become clearer below, it is important that Nietzsche who loved music as he does (without it, he says, “life would be a mistake”) does not simply cut to the chase and give music direct genealogical honors but interposes the spirit — that is to say, and as the third part treats below, of spirit as inspired intonement, as tone. This is the life of music but it is also its breath, spiritus.

If Nietzsche’s writing on the spirit of music tends to go unnoticed, Adorno’s claims regarding the space of sound tends to be refused, one no longer ‘hears’ what he is talking about. This usually goes along with defending jazz against Adorno (as if he had an attack worth worrying about). But what Adorno was talking about had to do with the sound-stripe to get all Princeton Radio Project technical about it. In other words, Adorno is talking about the decays, the losses, undergone when music transmitted via and thus reproduced via radio. This is especially not less true beyond Adorno’s era of bad technology and bad media as these losses also characterize (they are the point) what scholars like Greg Milner (very technically) name “perfect sound,” just “when broadcast artifice endeavors to appear as pristine nature, when sonic copy lays claim to origin, when music on the air acts as the reproduction of an original.” And to be sure, in the case of popular music we listen to “recorded sound” that is already “predominantly electronically sampled to begin with.”

Historians of recorded sound explore the specific conditions for generating this perfect sound as does Adorno: fitting the orchestra to the constraints of recording technology and even designing studios around that same technology (the engineering of musical sound only continues this project today). But the ideal of what Adorno calls “natural sound” hardly holds any longer (in part because we don’t and arguably cannot know what that would mean in Adorno’s sense) and Anders’ description of what he called the ‘ghostly’ tone of radio invoking as he does the aural aspect of sense invisibility as this today could hardly be more dominant in our wireless world (even if the sense of invisibility is reduced from loudspeakers to earphones that have grown from minimal earbuds to fashion headware, featuring radio-broadcasters headsets, themselves connected via Bluetooth to a personal ipod or other device — this is the point of individualization that Anders would insist upon, manifest today in the more rather than less auristic quality of online social networking).

Today, and usually without adverting to the fact of it, what we hear on the radio (when we bother to listen to radio at all, rather than programming our own programming, as it were, programming ourselves, with our own recorded ‘playlists’), are nearly always pre-recordings broadcast on the radio, and in this sense the musical work of art is technologically reproduced or mediated in several takes or at several removes.

In this sense, i.e., with respect to space, a recent apology for the use of new technology for recording musical performance, rock, pop, and classical, points however to the very same relevance of the space itself, the very space of the place itself to which I argue that k.d. lang ‘listens’ when she sings. The inventor, John Meyer, defends his new technology, named (and evoking one of the titles of Adorno’s essays) the Constellation Acoustic System, a system even more invisible than the SLAP system of acoustic enhancements already installed (but denied as being used) in various opera houses throughout the world. As Meyer informs Anthony Quint, “After 50 years of recording, we’ve learned that musicians actually interact with their spaces … It’s not a source and reverberation event — it’s one event talked about in two different ways.”

This point, and one can find other examples, complicates while also confirming Adorno’s claims in The Current of Music and to a lesser extent in his Introduction to the Sociology of Music. And to this same extent dependent upon pro sound techniques for its recording production, today’s music as remix artist Kode9 (Steve Goodman) as already cited and many others also have observed, depends on loudspeakers. Indeed, Goodman’s most recent release Martial Hauntology, is characterized as “an audio research box set which ‘investigates the properties of newly emergent super-directional speakers when coupled with infrasonic devices.”

For Adorno and Anders as rigorous object phenomenologists, it is all about the radio as such,
the object or thing that is a radio as a tuning and as an attunement. Songs broadcast on the radio have a quality all their own. And there would be enough if the effect. But the project began from the start as a phenomenonological (or what Nietzsche very classically named an ‘aesthetic’ or sensed) reflection on Nietzsche and Beethoven, hence not as a philosophy monograph wandering incidentally, accidentally into the field of music and musicology but precisely on the intersection of philosophy with music exactly in Nietzsche's thinking.

To situate this intersection required the addition of a set of reflections on the broader musiké technê of antiquity and not only as exemplified as this harmonic theory would be exemplified for Levarie and Levy as well as for McClain in terms of what he as a musicologist analyzed as the ‘Pythagorean Plato’ all three of them by way of the explicitly harmonic analyses of Albert Freiherr von Thimus on Pythagoras. There the associations converge on the esoteric, and how could they not? In this and related cases, the unheard refers to the soul in Plato as in Plotinus as well as Boethius and at the same time, as C.F. Audry Williams argued in his study of Aristoxenus more than a century ago, the only access to thinkers on harmony in this tradition will be by way of analogy with the modes of medieval or church music, whether it be as Georgiades and Dahlhaus (and Nietzsche) all argued, medieval church music as this itself can be seen, in Williams words, to have made possible the building up of the art of polyphony. This art arrived at its culmination in connection with the modes during the sixteenth century; and now music was to enter on its new phase, in which counterpoint and the young art of harmony were to be used with the major scale (derived, like the ecclesiastical modes, from the Greek diatonic system), and to be brought under the influence of the rhythm of the dance; while the whole of music was to be permeated with the culture that had been acquired through a study of Greek literature.

Williams proceeds to illustrate his discussion of Aristoxenus by using examples from Bach, Handel, and Gluck as well as Beethoven. In The Hallelujah Effect, I offer a discussion of some other authors who trace such parallels, including Jacques de Liege in the work of the nearly utterly neglected phenomenologist of music and listening, the late F. Joseph Smith and his studies of esoteric harmonics in the careful context of historical musicology as well as to the Greeks themselves for whom such esoteric harmonies go without saying.

III. BEETHOVEN IN THE BIRTH OF TRAGEDY

The third part of The Hallelujah Effect features Friedrich Nietzsche's theory of quantitational [quantitierenden] rhythm together with his account of ancient Greek musical drama as a Gesammtkunstwerk beyond even Wagner's imaginings. Nietzsche had discovered that the text of ancient Greek tragedy should be read as its own musical score. Thus to understand ancient Greek lyric poetry and tragedy would not require what did not (by definition) exist: namely a second system of writing along with the first, that is in effect: a missing score. For Nietzsche this second system was the invention of the Alexandrians and to this extent, reading the Greek text of musical drama in the age of Aeschylus or Sophocles would be akin to sight-reading music for Nietzsche, the author in 1870 of “Greek Music Drama" and, yet more explicitly, “On Music and Words.”

Nietzsche's illustrative philological notes (explicitly didactic as these were prepared for his courses at Basel) emphasize that for the Greeks reading was a fundamentally sounded out, a 'spirited' phenomenon and the tragic poet's poetic compositions accordingly would be composed as much for the ear as for the eye (Nietzsche's Zarathustra speaks of “listening” with one's eyes). Thus Nietzsche invokes a different readerly praxis (or performative technique) in his On the Theory of Quantitational Rhythm, ranged under the heading “Arsis–Thesis” itself a conventional distinction Nietzsche dates to Horace and which Williams traces to Bacheios (following Westphal) and differentiated into two kinds of quantifying rhythm, marked either with the hand or the foot, “by which one indicates the tact interval: percussiones,” in other words, keeping time by “striking time.”

As Nietzsche explains — and it is just to his purpose here to be repetitive (as is Westphal and others writing on the same theme) — there are two distinct styles or “arts” of keeping time: again, one for Visual indication, “for the eye using the hand,” and the other “for the ear with an audible tap of the hand, finger or foot.”

5
Nietzsche here invokes the standard for the Aristoxenian order of time, but goes beyond it with his emphasis (this would be the underlined hint in his Theory of Quantitational [Quantitierenden] Rhythm in Fig. 3), that what ultimately aids us in this regard is language or usage: "Sprachgebrauch." Here what is at stake is a pitch rather than a stress accent for Nietzsche, a point which the musicological classicist, Audry Williams approaches only to lose the point nearly at once more than a century ago. Williams writes that "the old Attic refinements were forgotten at the period of the advent of Christianity, owing to the loss of the feeling for time-measurement in poetry, and the rise of accent or stress in its place." 42 Like Westphal (and Aristoxenus), Nietzsche emphasized time-measurement and to that he added a clear denial of "accent or stress" or what he usually calls ictus. Thus Nietzsche either declares that there is no ictus or, else and distinct from the Latin stress ictus, that the Greeks had in its place an ictus we can barely imagine, that is the ictus of pitch or tone — the spirit or sound of music.

Nietzsche's concern is the relation of music and word as the literal musicality of the Greek word and for this the phenomenology of media is (or could be) key. Just as the late Friedrich Kittler remarks, Nietzsche was a philologist. "a rarity," as Kittler also emphasizes "among philosophers." 43 Both Nietzsche and Kittler emphasize the importance not merely of reading but reading hermeneutically, phenomenologically and, as I argue, in the case of ancient Greek, especially in the case of ancient tragedy, such a hermeneutico-phenomenological reading presupposes an attention to sound as we; as to the socio-political culture, that is the very alien, as Nietzsche never ceased to underscore for us, context of ancient Greek society in which the tragic work of art was also and always a religious or divine service that extended over many days, in a time and a place beyond the everyday. 44

Nietzsche seeks to recount in what he understands as a "birth" 45 of an art form out of the Spirit of Music is Beethoven — and nothing less iconically (one could say) "Beethoven" than the very choral fourth movement of the Ninth Symphony. To raise the larger question of what Nietzsche meant by the spirit of music as the origin of the tragic artform permits us to dispense with, as he does, the assumption that the tragic artwork is generated by life's tragedies or its more dismal aspects. Instead Nietzsche has recourse to musical compositional devices, meaning dissonance and I point out that Nietzsche, who saw himself as a composer, knew Albrechtsberger's Grundliche Anweisung zur Composition mit deutlichen und ausführlichen Exempeln, zum Selbstunterrichte 47 as well as the studies in compositional theories and harmony attributed to Beethoven himself in Henry Hago Pierson's edition of Ludwig van Beethovens Studien im Generalbass, Kontrapunkt und in der Compositionslehre, most particularly considering the extensive contributions on dissonance to be found in this last. 48 I am inclined to think that it was Nietzsche's familiarity with both Albrechtsberger and Pierson/Beethoven which rendered him as amenable to the otherwise devastating criticisms of his own musical compositions by Hans von Bülow who in due course referred in his critique to points made by Nietzsche himself in his first book and who pointed out to the young scholar that if one wishes to compose music it is necessary to learn the rules of composition.

As Nietzsche himself observed, the trick of dissonance which, in a musical context, he also called "pain," is precisely its distinction from consonance and the elusive key to harmony. This he expresses in the complicated formula of the becoming-human-of-dissonance. This is the way his gnomic notion of the "Menschwerdung der Dissonanz" that is to say, the becoming-human-of-dissonance, phrased in a single word, functions in Nietzsche's text: "and what else is the human?" he asks, understood together with his earlier investigations into Greek rhythm and meter.

WORKS CITED


Ashby, Arved. Absolute Musik: Mechanical Reproduction. Berkeley: University of


Dahlhaus, Carl. Between Romanticism and
ON THE HALLELUJAH EFFECT:
PRIMING CONSUMERS, RECORDING MUSIC, AND THE SPIRIT OF TRAGEDY

2013. Print.
ON THE HALLELUJAH EFFECT:
PRIMING CONSUMERS, RECORDING MUSIC, AND THE SPIRIT OF TRAGEDY


NOTES
3. In Ivan Illich’s In the Vineyard of the Text, his paean to this technology, the first “truly phonetic writing was a one-time invention, made in Greece around 770 BC.” It was characterized as Illich explains with beautiful concision, by the use of “signs for both consonants (which are obstacles to breath) and for vowels (which indicate the color given to the column of air that is spirited out of the lungs).” 103.
5. See Babich, The Hallelujah Effect as well as my essay in Perfect Sound Forever, “The Birth of kd lang’s Hallelujah out of the Spirit of Music: Performing Desire and Recording Consciousness” on Facebook and YouTube, which is also available on video: http://digital.library.fordham.edu/cdm/singleitem/collection/VIDEOS/id/214.
8. Steve Goodman electronic music artist as well as a philosopher of what he names memetic music, writes that “[s]onic warfare is therefore as much about the logistics of imperception (unsound) as it is perception. The bandwidth of human audibility is a fold on the vibratory continuum of matter. With reference to military research into acoustic weaponry, this molecular backdrop will be mapped as a vibratory field into which the audible is implicated.” Goodman, Sonic Warfare: Sound, Affect, and the Ecology of Fear, 9. See also Clive Stafford Smith’s 2008 article in The Guardian: “Welcome to ‘the disco’: For US interrogators seeking to disorientate and break Iraqi prisoners it’s ‘torture lite’— rock music played at excruciating volumes” as well as Weinberger’s: “A Voice Only You Can Hear: DARPA’s Sonic Projector.”
9. See Bernays, Crystallizing Public Opinion as well as Ellul, Propaganda.
10. See the overview and contributions to the US government publication, edited by Frank L. Goldstein and Benjamin F. Findley, Psychological Operations: Principles and Case Studies, particularly Col Dennis P. Walko’s Psychological Operations in Panama During Operations Just Cause and Promote Liberty, 249-277.
ON THE HALLELUJAH EFFECT
PRIMING CONSUMERS, RECORDING MUSIC, AND THE SPIRIT OF TRAGEDY

11 This is the limitation that is perhaps obvious for such recent (all-too) quick films such as Tiffany Schlain’s 2011 Connected: An Autobiography of Love, Death, and Technology. But quite without such limitations, see Sherry Turkle’s Alone Together.

12 See for a discussion the very beginning of Babich, The Hallelujah Effect.

13 Manjeet Singh Bhatia, “Internet Sex Addiction – A New Distinct Disorder,” p. 3. See too the recent article from Mark D. Griffiths who has been writing on this for more than a decade, Griffiths, “Internet Sex Addiction.” Naomi Wolf observes that the online images and sounds of porn have come to stand in place of reality: “if you open your focus to an endless stream of ever-more-transgressive images of cybersex slaves, that is what it will take to turn you on,” “How Porn is Destroying Modern Sex Lives.”

14 Exceptions to this priority would be Horkheimer and Adorno with their 1944 Dialectic of Enlightenment, in addition to Adorno’s already mentioned publications on music and radio.

15 See for a retrospective, Bargh’s “What Have We Been Priming All These Years?” as well as Dijksterhuis, et al., “The Power of the Subliminal” in addition to the more classic philosophical authors discussed below.

16 It is to make a related but different point that Goodman’s Sonic Warfare points to the relative absence of scholarly material on classified, speaking from a military or political perspective, affairs.

17 Such ‘covert’ priming corresponds to what Vance Packard triumphantly reported as making news in 1956, featured as it was on the front page of the London Sunday Times. As Packard reports, “certain United States advertisers were experimenting with ‘sub-threshold effects’ in seeking to insinuate messages to people past their conscious guard.” Packard, The Hidden Persuaders, 62.

18 Adorno explored just this “current” in his thusly titled Current of Music.

19 See Bargh, “The Most Powerful Manipulative Messages Are Hiding in Plain Sight.”

20 Bernays, Crystalizing Public Opinion.

21 The connection between Bernays and Freud (and as Anna Freud) is the topic in the context of the exploration of political manipulation and control in Adam Curtis’s 2002 BBC television documentary, The Century of the Self.

22 See Dichter, The Strategy of Desire. See further Stefan Schwarzkopf and Rainer Gries, eds., Ernest Dichter and Motivation Research as well as Franz Kreuzer et al., eds., A Tiger in the Tank. As a tribute to this efficacy, the 2011 obituary printed on the last page The Economist (this is exceeding pride of place in this journal) highlighted Dichter’s transformation of marketing by means of sex as “Retail Therapy.”

23 See Adorno, Current of Music, was largely composed during the time of his work on the Princeton Radio Project in English (working together with George Simpson, as Ernest McClain, a colleague and contemporary of Simpson’s has helpfully noted).


25 Perhaps one reasons for this is that an excerpt from his work has been anthologized in more than one place and as a result tends to be taken for the whole. I refer to Bennett’s “The Realities of Practice.”

26 In addition to specific studies of Lazarsfeld and Adorno, on which much more is needed, see Rose Rosengard Subotnik on the complications of style and sound with respect to Adorno in her exceptionally rigorous study, Developing Variations and see too her Deconstructive Variations.

27 I refer here to Greg Milner’s Perfecting Sound Forever in addition, more generally, to Chanan, Repeated Takes, see further Arved Ashby’s Absolute Music, as well as with specific reference to Adorno, Alf Björnberg, “Learning to Listen to Perfect Sound.” Björnberg himself draws upon Roth’s 2004 Capturing Sound to which Milner’s study is likewise indebted as are many others.


29 Ibid.

30 Cited in Andrew Quint. “Big Voice in a Small Room.”

31 As Goodman is a performance artist, so I prefer to take his word for it.

32 Glenn Jackson, “Kode9 and Toby Heys Launch AUDINT, Release ‘Martial Hauntology’ Box Set.”

33 See McClain’s The Pythagorean Plato.

34 On which see for example Schulze, “Number and Proportion in Plato’s Political Theory, Plato’s Political Philosophy and Contemporary Democratic Theory.”
ON THE HALLELUJAH EFFECT: PRIMING CONSUMERS, RECORDING MUSIC, AND THE SPIRIT OF TRAGEDY

35 See Williams, *The Aristoxenian Theory of Musical Rhythm*, xiii. Williams offers a summary of the 19th century philological tradition (that is also Nietzsche's own background), especially Rudolph Westphal (whom Nietzsche also cites) and particularly drawing upon the second volume of F. A. Gevaert's 1881 *La Musique de L'Antiquité*, abstracting a summary of Greek sources in Williams, 3-6.

36 See F. Joseph Smith's own contribution "Variation in Music and Thought." Nicole Pedone offers a discussion (in Italian) of Smith's contribution to music and phenomenology.

37 This is also a coordination of musicology and numerological studies as these are inevitably Pythagorean but without which there is no access to the sacred medieval musical tradition, including Boethian number theory, as Smith shows. An expert on the Jacques de Liége, see his essay "Greek Letter Notation in the Speculum Musicæ as well as Smith's key study of Liége, F. Joseph Smith, *Iacobii Leodiensis Speculum Musicæ*. On the broader historical tradition, which may also be connected with Nietzsche's studies of quantitative rhythm, see Dorit Esther Tanay, *Noting Music, Marking Culture*. See too, much more broadly afield in theological or metaphysical readings of music and time, Peter Manchester's *The Syntax of Time*, 29-30. See too for a more extended discussion, the section on Augustine's *On Music* in Manchester's forthcoming *Temporality and Trinity*.

38 Nietzsche, "Erster Vortrag: Das griechische Musikdrama."

39 Nietzsche, "On Music and Words." Carl Dahlhaus has emphasized Nietzsche's importance in connection with Beethoven, including a translation of Nietzsche's "Über Musik und Wort" in his *Between Romanticism and Modernism*, 103-119. In addition, Dahlhaus's then assistant in Berlin, the Stanford musicologist, Stephen Hinton, is also useful. See Hinton's "Not Which Tones? The Crux of Beethoven's Ninth," reviewing (as Ian Bent also takes up) this thoroughly hermeneutic relection in this manner. For Hinton, "the beginning of the baritone recitative ,O Freunde, nicht diese Töne!" (Ibid.) underlines Beethoven’s "irony" in terms of the very notion of tone as such.


41 Nietzsche, *Griechische Rhythmik*, p. 102. See for further discussion Bornmann, "Nietzsches metrische Studien," as well as the late Angèle Kremer-Marietti's "Rhétorique et Rythmique chez Nietzsche." Kremer-Marietti refers to Marcel Jousse, *L'anthropologie du rythme* as this develops in Jousse, *Les Récitatifs rythmiques*: See too Edgard Sienaert, "Marcel Jousse" See in, English, Jousse, *The Oral Style*. Nietzsche also emphasizes the narrowness of the Greek stage, a constraint that also set the actors, as it were in a kind of "relief," and emphasizing the dance in question not as freely moving, as we assume today, but as more a "beautiful walking than a whirling dance." Nietzsche, *Zur Theorie der quantitirenenden Rhythmik*, 270. Here one is reminded of Augustine’s definition of rhythm as *ars bene moveendi* (the science of beautiful movement).


44 Friedrich Kittler, "Interview," *Die Welt*, 10.08.00: "Wir sind programmierbar:"

45 See on this Nicole Loraux, *The Mourning Voice*.

46 The Nietzsche of genealogical thinking repeats this notion of birth and distinguishes it in his "On Music and Words."


48 See Beethoven's notes from his studies with Albrechtsberger as we may read these and as Nietzsche would have known them in Pierson's 1853 edition of Seyfried's 1832 edition of *Ludwig van Beethovens Studien im Generalbass*. *Contrapunkt und in der Compositionslehre aus dessen Handschriftlichen Nachlass gesammelt und herausgegeben von Ignaz Xaver von Seyfried*, throughout but especially 130.